DECLARATION OF JAMES R. CRISFIELD JR.

Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1746, I, Commander James R. Crisfield Jr., Judge Advocate General's Corps, United States Navy, hereby state that to the best of my knowledge, information and belief, the following is true, accurate and correct:

1. I am the Legal Advisor to the Combatant Status Review Tribunals. In that capacity I am the principal legal advisor to the Director, Combatant Status Review Tribunals, and provide advice to Tribunals on legal, evidentiary, procedural, and other matters. I also review the record of proceedings in each Tribunal for legal sufficiency in accordance with standards prescribed in the Combatant Status Review Tribunal establishment order and implementing directive.

2. I hereby certify that the documents attached hereto constitute a true and accurate copy of the portions of the record of proceedings before the Combatant Status Review Tribunal related to petitioner Uthman Abdul Rahim Mohammed Uthman that are suitable for public release. The portions of the record that are classified or considered law enforcement sensitive are
not attached hereto. I have redacted information that would personally identify certain U.S. Government personnel in order to protect the personal security of those individuals. I have also redacted internee serial numbers because certain combinations of internee serial numbers with other information become classified under applicable classification guidance.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Dated: 30 Sep 04

James R. Crisfield Jr.
CDR, JAGC, USN
From: Director, Combatant Status Review Tribunal

Subj: REVIEW OF COMBATANT STATUS REVIEW TRIBUNAL FOR DETAINEE ISN #

Ref: (a) Deputy Secretary of Defense Order of 7 July 2004
(b) Secretary of the Navy Order of 29 July 2004

1. I concur in the decision of the Combatant Status Review Tribunal that Detainee ISN # meets the criteria for designation as an Enemy Combatant, in accordance with references (a) and (b).

2. This case is now considered final, and the detainee will be scheduled for an Administrative Review Board.

J. M. McGARRAH
RADM, CEC, USN

Distribution:
NSC (Mr. John Bellinger)
DoS (Ambassador Prosper)
DASD-DA
JCS (J5)
SOUTHCOM (CoS)
COMJTFGTMO
OARDEC (Fwd)
CITF Ft Belvoir
MEMORANDUM

From: Legal Advisor
To: Director, Combatant Status Review Tribunal

Subj: LEGAL SUFFICIENCY REVIEW OF COMBATANT STATUS REVIEW TRIBUNAL FOR DETAINEE ISN #

Ref: (a) Deputy Secretary of Defense Order of 7 July 2004
    (b) Secretary of the Navy Implementation Directive of 29 July 2004

Encl: (1) Appointing Order for Tribunal #8 of 13 September 2004
    (2) Record of Tribunal Proceedings

1. Legal sufficiency review has been completed on the subject Combatant Status Review Tribunal in accordance with references (a) and (b). After reviewing the record of the Tribunal, I find that:

   a. The detainee was properly notified of the Tribunal process and affirmatively elected not to participate in the Tribunal. However, he provided his Personal Representative with information and requested his Personal Representative present that information, in the form of an oral statement, to the Tribunal. The Personal Representative related the detainee's information to the Tribunal during the unclassified session.

   b. The Tribunal was properly convened and constituted by enclosure (1).

   c. The Tribunal complied with the provisions of references (a) and (b). Note that some information in exhibits R-3, R-4, R-5, R-6 and R-7 was redacted. The FBI properly certified in exhibit R-2 that the redacted information would not support a determination that the detainee is not an enemy combatant.

   d. The detainee made no requests for witnesses or other evidence.

   e. The Tribunal’s decision that detainee # is properly classified as an enemy combatant was unanimous.

   f. The detainee’s Personal Representative was given the opportunity to review the record of proceedings and declined to submit comments to the Tribunal.

2. The proceedings and decision of the Tribunal are legally sufficient and no corrective action is required.
LEGAL SUFFICIENCY REVIEW OF COMBATANT STATUS REVIEW TRIBUNAL FOR DETAINEE ISN #

3. I recommend that the decision of the Tribunal be approved and the case be considered final.

JAMES R. CRISFIELD JR.
CDR, JAGC, USN
From: Director, Combatant Status Review Tribunals

Subj: APPOINTMENT OF COMBATANT STATUS REVIEW TRIBUNAL #8

Ref: (a) Convening Authority Appointment Letter of 9 July 2004

By the authority given to me in reference (a), a Combatant Status Review Tribunal established by “Implementation of Combatant Status Review Tribunal Procedures for Enemy Combatants Detained at Guantanamo Bay Naval Base, Cuba” dated 29 July 2004 is hereby convened. It shall hear such cases as shall be brought before it without further action of referral or otherwise.

The following commissioned officers shall serve as members of the Tribunal:

MEMBERS:

[Blank]

Colonel, U.S. Marine Corps Reserve; President

[Blank]

Colonel, U.S. Army; Member

[Blank]

Lieutenant Colonel, JAGC, U.S. Army; Member

(JAG)

J. M. McGARRAH
Rear Admiral
Civil Engineer Corps
United States Naval Reserve
MEMORANDUM FOR DIRECTOR, CSRT

FROM: OARDEC FORWARD Commander

SUBJECT: CSRT Record of Proceedings ICO ISN# 1


2. If there are any questions regarding this package, point of contact on this matter is the undersigned at DSN 660-3088.

[Signature]

DAVID L. TAYLOR
Colonel, USAF
(U) Combatant Status Review Tribunal Decision Report Cover Sheet

(U) This Document is UNCLASSIFIED Upon Removal of Enclosures (2) (3) and (4).

(U) TRIBUNAL PANEL: #8

(U) ISN#: __________

Ref:  
(a) (U) Convening Order for Tribunal #8 of 13 September 2004 (U)  
(b) (U) CSRT Implementation Directive of 29 July 2004 (U)  
(c) (U) DEPSECDEF Memo of 7 July 2004 (U)

Encl:  
(1) (U) Unclassified Summary of Basis For Tribunal Decision (U)  
(2) (U) Classified Summary of Basis for Tribunal Decision (S/NF)  
(3) (U) Summary of Detainee/Witness Testimony (U/FOUO)  
(4) (U) Copies of Documentary Evidence Presented (S/NF)  
(5) (U) Personal Representative’s Record Review (U)

1. (U) This Tribunal was convened on 16 September 2004 by references (a) and (b) to make a determination as to whether the detainee meets the criteria to be designated as an enemy combatant as defined in reference (c).

2. (U) On 16 September 2004 the Tribunal determined, by a preponderance of the evidence, that Detainee #__________is properly designated as an enemy combatant, as defined in reference (c).

3. (U) In particular, the Tribunal finds that this detainee is a member of, or affiliated with, al Qa'ida, as more fully discussed in the enclosures.

4. (U) Enclosure (1) provides an unclassified account of the basis for the Tribunal’s decision. A detailed account of the evidence considered by the Tribunal and its findings of fact are contained in enclosures (1) and (2).

Colonel, U.S. Marine Corps  
Tribunal President
UNCLASSIFIED SUMMARY OF BASIS FOR TRIBUNAL DECISION

(Enclosure (1) to Combatant Status Review Tribunal Decision Report)

TRIBUNAL PANEL: #8
ISN #: #8

1. Introduction

As the Combatant Status Review Tribunal (CSRT) Decision Report indicates, the Tribunal has determined that this detainee is properly classified as an enemy combatant and is a member of, or affiliated with, al-Qaida, and was engaged in hostilities against the United States or its coalition partners. In reaching its conclusions, the Tribunal considered both classified and unclassified information. The following is an account of the unclassified evidence considered by the Tribunal and other pertinent information. Classified evidence considered by the Tribunal is discussed in Enclosure (2) to the CSRT Decision Report.

2. Synopsis of Proceedings

The unclassified evidence presented to the Tribunal by the Recorder indicated that the Detainee voluntarily traveled in March 2001 from Quetta, Pakistan to Kandahar, Afghanistan where he stayed in a Taliban house. From March 2001 until December 2001, the Detainee traveled between Khost and Kabul to teach the Koran. The Detainee is said to have visited Osama Bin Laden's home and has associated with two suspects in the USS Cole bombing in Yemen. The Detainee received advanced military training at the Tamak Farms training camp and was captured and detained in the Tora Bora region of Afghanistan. The Detainee, in his statement delivered by his personal representative, denied being an Al-Qaida member. The Tribunal President's evidentiary and witness rulings are explained below.

3. Evidence Considered by the Tribunal

The Tribunal considered the following evidence in reaching its conclusions:

a. Exhibits: D-a through D-b and R-1 through R-12.

b. Testimony of the following persons: None.

c. Oral statement of the Detainee as given to the Personal Representative during the interview process, and by the Personal Representative during the Tribunal.
4. Rulings by the Tribunal on Detainee Requests for Evidence or Witnesses

The Detainee requested no witnesses and requested no additional evidence be produced; therefore, no rulings on these matters were required.

5. Discussion of Unclassified Evidence

The Tribunal considered the following unclassified evidence in making its determinations:

The recorder offered Exhibits R-1 and R-2 into evidence during the unclassified portion of the proceeding. Exhibit R-1 is the Unclassified Summary of Evidence. While this summary is helpful in that it provides a broad outline of what the Tribunal can expect to see, it is not persuasive in that it provides conclusory statements without supporting unclassified evidence.

The Tribunal found the following unclassified evidence unpersuasive in making its determinations: Exhibit R-2, a request from the Federal Bureau of Investigation to redact certain information from its recorded interviews with the Detainee from the “FBI Form 302” or “FD 302” was not helpful to the Tribunal in determining whether the Detainee was properly classified as an enemy combatant. To be more specific, the mere declaration that “inappropriate” release of the information “could damage the national security of the United States and compromise ongoing FBI investigations,” without a discussion of the underlying information and the reasons why its release to the Tribunal would be damaging to U.S. national security or compromising to current future FBI investigations, was not helpful to the Tribunal. The Tribunal does not consider release of information to its members to be “inappropriate,” nor has the FBI offered any justification why such release should be considered “inappropriate.” The Tribunal therefore found Exhibit R-2 to be without merit.

Essentially the only unclassified evidence the Tribunal had to consider was the Detainee’s testimony as provided by the Personal Representative during his interviews with the Detainee. A summarized transcript of the Detainee’s testimony is attached as CSRT Decision Report Enclosure (3), and the Personal Representative’s notes of his interviews with the Detainee are attached as Exhibit D-b. In summary, the Detainee stated that he is not a member of al-Qaida or any other terrorist organization. The Detainee alleges that he traveled to Kandahar, Afghanistan via Quetta, Pakistan to be a teacher of the Quran in Afghanistan and to make money. He stayed at a Taliban house in order to gain entry into Afghanistan because they were the ruling government. He has never known or visited Osama Bin Laden. Additionally, he denies any knowledge of the USS Cole bombing. The Detainee indicated that he never participated in military operations and denies having received any advanced training.
The Tribunal also relied on certain classified evidence in reaching its decision. A discussion of the classified evidence is found in Enclosure (2) to the Combatant Status Review Tribunal Decision Report.

6. Consultations with the CSRT Legal Advisor

No issues arose during the course of this hearing that required consultation with the CSRT legal advisor.

7. Conclusions of the Tribunal

Upon careful review of all the evidence presented in this matter, the Tribunal makes the following determinations:

   a. The Detainee was mentally and physically capable of participating in the proceeding. No medical or mental health evaluation was deemed necessary.

   b. The Detainee understood the Tribunal proceedings, but elected not to participate in the Tribunal process, as indicated in Exhibit D-a. The Detainee did submit an oral statement during the interview process and requested that the Personal Representative present his statement to the Tribunal during the unclassified portion of the proceedings.

   c. The Detainee is properly classified as an enemy combatant and is a member of, or affiliated with, al-Qaida, and engaged in hostilities against United States or its coalition partners.

8. Dissenting Tribunal Member's report

None. The Tribunal reached a unanimous decision.

Respectfully submitted,

Colonel, U.S. Marine Corps
Tribunal President
Summarized Unsworn Detainee Statement

The Personal Representative made the following statement on behalf of the Detainee, who was absent during the proceedings.

The Personal Representative states that these are comments from the Detainee's notes of 15 September 2004 in response to his unclassified summary of evidence and the Detainee asked him to dictate these notes at the Tribunal.

- 3(a) The detainee is affiliated with al Qaeda.

Detainee stated he is not a member of al Qaeda or any other terrorist organization and he did not see or know any other members. He also did not hear of al Qaeda until his arrival to Guantanamo Bay.

- 3(a)(1) The detainee voluntarily traveled from Yemen to Quetta, Pakistan where he stayed in a Taliban house in March 2001. The detainee admitted to seeing an assault weapon in the Taliban house during his stay.

Detainee states that he was deceived to travel to Quetta, Pakistan. He was told that he would be a teacher of the Koran in Afghanistan and make much money. He was told that he had to go to a Taliban house to gain entry to Afghanistan because they were the ruling government. He did not see any weapons while in that house.

- 3(a)(2) The detainee voluntarily traveled from Quetta, Pakistan to Kandahar, Afghanistan in March 2001.

Detainee stated that he wanted to go back to Yemen, but was not allowed. He then decided that he would travel to Afghanistan and then try other means to get back to Yemen.

- 3(a)(3) The detainee traveled between Khost and Kabul, Afghanistan to teach the Koran from March 2001 to December 2001.

Detainee stated this is true.


Detainee never knew or has never seen or visited Usama Bin Laden.
3(a)(5) The detainee is associated with two suspects in the USS Cole bombing in Yemen.

Detainee denies any knowledge of the USS Cole bombing.

3(b) The detainee participated in military operations against the coalition.

Detainee denies any participation in any military operations.

3(b)(1) The detainee attended advanced training at Tarnak Farm near Kandahar, Afghanistan.

Detainee never heard of Tarnak Farm and denies receiving any advanced training.

3(b)(2) The detainee fled Afghanistan subsequent to the fall of Kabul. The detainee was caught and detained in the Tora Bora region.

When the Taliban government fell, he was in Kabul. His friend, who was Afghani, told him to leave because the people in Kabul hate Arabs. He left and went to Khost and then headed to Pakistan. He turned himself in to Pakistan authorities so that they could take him to the Yemeni Embassy. He was not arrested. Pakistan authorities told US forces that he was al-Qaeda. He was turned over to the US forces in Peshawar, Pakistan and US forces took him to Kandahar, AF.

The Detainee asks that the Tribunal make their decision with the truth and that all the information in his unclassified summary are lies and fabricated to hold him. He went to Pakistan and Afghanistan to teach the Koran and he taught the Koran in Yemen before he left for Pakistan. The Detainee states that he is innocent and that the whole world is his witness.

AUTHENTICATION

I certify the material contained in this transcript is a true and accurate summary of the testimony given during the proceedings.

Colonel, U.S. Marine Corps
President, CSRT
DETAINEE ELECTION FORM

Date: 14 Sep 04
Start Time: 1540
End Time: 1640

Personal Representative: [Name/Rank]

Translator Required? YES   Language? ARABIC

CSRT Procedure Read to Detainee or Written Copy Read by Detainee? YES

Detainee Election:

☐ Wants to Participate in Tribunal
☒ Affirmatively Declines to Participate in Tribunal
☐ Uncooperative or Unresponsive

Personal Representative Comments:
Detainee was very difficult to make understand the process.
Detainee wants time to decide to participate. I pressed very hard to get him for an election but he refused and needed time. I request that another follow-up interview be scheduled for tomorrow, 15 Sep 04.
UNCLASSIFIED//FOUO

DETAINEE ELECTION FORM

Date: 15 Sep 04
Start Time: 1115
End Time: 1155

ISN#: ____________________________

Personal Representative Comments:

Detainee has affirmatively elected not to participate but has provided oral notes that I will present at the Tribunal.

Detainee has requested no witnesses
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Classification</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>R1</td>
<td>Unclassified Summary</td>
<td>UNCLASSIFIED</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R2</td>
<td>FBI Request for Redaction of National Security Information 8 SEP 04</td>
<td>UNCLASSIFIED</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R3</td>
<td>FBI 302 18 MAR 02</td>
<td>FOUO/LES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R4</td>
<td>FBI 302 11 NOV 02</td>
<td>FOUO/LES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R5</td>
<td>FBI 302 05 SEP 02</td>
<td>FOUO/LES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R6</td>
<td>FBI 302 25 OCT 02</td>
<td>FOUO/LES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R7</td>
<td>FBI 302 10 JUN 03</td>
<td>FOUO/LES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R8</td>
<td>IIR 6 034 0847 03</td>
<td>SECRET//NOFORN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R9</td>
<td>IIR 6 034 0789 02</td>
<td>SECRET</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R10</td>
<td>JTF GTMO Baseball Card</td>
<td>SECRET//NOFORN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R11</td>
<td>IIR 6 034 0046 03</td>
<td>SECRET</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R12</td>
<td>JTF-GTMO MFR 27 AUG 04</td>
<td>SECRET//NOFORN</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TO: Personal Representative

FROM: OIC, CSRT (02 September 04)

Subject: Summary of Evidence for Combatant Status Review Tribunal UTHMAN, Uthman Abdul Rahim Mohammed

1. Under the provisions of the Secretary of the Navy Memorandum, dated 29 July 2004, Implementation of Combatant Status Review Tribunal Procedures for Enemy Combatants Detained at Guantanamo Bay Naval Base Cuba, a Tribunal has been appointed to review the detainee’s designation as an enemy combatant.

2. An enemy combatant has been defined as “an individual who was part of or supporting the Taliban or al Qaeda forces, or associated forces that are engaged in hostilities against the United States or its coalition partners. This includes any person who committed a belligerent act or has directly supported hostilities in aid of enemy armed forces.”

3. The United States Government has previously determined that the detainee is an enemy combatant. This determination is based on information possessed by the United States that indicates that he is affiliated with al Qaeda and participated in military operations against the United States or its coalition partners.

   a. The detainee is affiliated with al Qaeda:

      1. The detainee voluntarily traveled from Yemen to Quetta, Pakistan where he stayed in a Taliban house in March 2001. The detainee admitted to seeing an assault weapon in the Taliban house during his stay.

      2. The detainee voluntarily traveled from Quetta, Pakistan to Kandahar, Afghanistan in March 2001.

      3. The detainee traveled between Khost and Kabul, Afghanistan to teach the Koran from March 2001 to December 2001.


      5. The detainee is associated with two suspects in the USS Cole bombing in Yemen.

   b. The detainee participated in military operations against the coalition.

      1. The detainee attended advanced training at Tarnak Farm Near Kandahar, Afghanistan.
2. The detainee fled Afghanistan subsequent to the fall of Kabul. The detainee was caught and detained in the Tora Bora region.

4. The detainee has the opportunity to contest his designation as an enemy combatant. The Tribunal will endeavor to arrange for the presence of any reasonably available witnesses or evidence that the detainee desires to call or introduce to prove that he is not an enemy combatant. The Tribunal President will determine the reasonable availability of evidence or witnesses.
Memorandum

To: Department of Defense
   Office of Administrative Review for Detained Enemy Combatants
   Col. David Taylor, OIC, CSRT

From: FBI GTMO
       Counterterrorism Division

Subject: REQUEST FOR REDACTION OF NATIONAL SECURITY INFORMATION

Pursuant to the Secretary of the Navy Order of 29 July 2004, Implementation of Combatant Review Tribunal Procedures for Enemy Combatants Detained at Guantanamo Bay Naval Base, Cuba, Section D, paragraph 2, the FBI requests redaction of the information herein marked\(^1\). The FBI makes this request on the basis that said information relates to the national security of the United States\(^2\). Inappropriate dissemination of said information could damage the national security of the United States and compromise ongoing FBI investigations.

CERTIFICATION THAT REDACTED INFORMATION DOES NOT SUPPORT A DETERMINATION THAT THE DETAINEE IS NOT AN ENEMY COMBATANT

The FBI certifies the aforementioned redaction contains no information that would support a determination that the detainee is not an enemy combatant.

The following documents relative to ISN \(\_\_\_\_\_\) have been redacted by the FBI and provided to the OARDEC:

FD-302 dated 03/18/2002
FD-302 dated 09/05/2002

\(^1\)Redactions are blackened out on the OARDEC provided FBI document.

\(^2\)See Executive Order 12958
Memorandum from [Redacted] to Col. David Taylor
Re: REQUEST FOR REDACTION, 09/08/2004

If you need additional assistance, please contact On Scene Commander [Redacted] or Intelligence Analyst [Redacted].
Memorandum

To : Department of Defense
   Office of Administrative Review
   for Detained Enemy Combatants
   Col. David Taylor, OIC, CSRT

From : FBI GTMO
       Counterterrorism Division

Subject: REQUEST FOR REDACTION OF NATIONAL SECURITY INFORMATION

Pursuant to the Secretary of the Navy Order of 29 July 2004, Implementation of Combatant Review Tribunal Procedures for Enemy Combatants Detained at Guantanamo Bay Naval Base, Cuba, Section D, paragraph 2, the FBI requests redaction of the information herein marked1. The FBI makes this request on the basis that said information relates to the national security of the United States2. Inappropriate dissemination of said information could damage the national security of the United States and compromise ongoing FBI investigations.

CERTIFICATION THAT REDACTED INFORMATION DOES NOT SUPPORT A DETERMINATION THAT THE DETAINEE IS NOT AN ENEMY COMBATANT

The FBI certifies the aforementioned redaction contains no information that would support a determination that the detainee is not an enemy combatant.

The following documents relative to ISN have been redacted by the FBI and provided to the OARDEC, GTMO:

FD-302 dated 10/25/2002
FD-302 dated 06/10/2003

1Redactions are blackened out on the OARDEC provided FBI document.

2See Executive Order 12958
Memorandum from [REDACTED] to Col. David Taylor
Re: REQUEST FOR REDACTION, 09/15/2004

If you need additional assistance, please contact On Scene Commander [REDACTED] or Intelligence Analyst [REDACTED].
Detainee Uthman Abdul Rahim Mohammed Uthman dictated the following notes on 15 Sept 2004 in response to his unclassified summary of evidence and has ask me to dictate these notes at the Tribunal.

Para 3a – Detainee stated that he is not a member of Al-Qaeda or any other terrorist organization and he did not see or know any other members. He also did not hear of Al-Qaeda until his arrival to Guantanamo Bay.

Para 3a1 – Detainee states that he was deceived to travel to Quetta, PK. He was told that he would be a teacher of the Quran in Afghanistan and make much money. He was told that he had to go to a Taliban house to gain entry to AF because they were the ruling government. He did not see any weapons while in that house.

Para 3a2 – Detainee stated that he wanted to go back to Yemen but was not allowed. He then decided that he would travel to Afghanistan and then try other means to get back to Yemen.

Para 3a3 – True

Para 3a4 – Detainee never knew or has seen or visited Usama Bin Ladin

Para 3a5 – Detainee denies any knowledge of the USS Cole bombing

Para 3b – Detainee denies any participation in any military operations

Para 3b1 – Detainee never heard of Trnak Farm and denies receiving any advanced training.

Para 3b2 – When the Taliban government fell, he was in Kabul. His friend, who was Afghani, told him to leave because the people in Kabul hate Arabs. He left and went to Khost and then headed to Pakistan. He turned himself in to Pakistan authorities so that they could take him to the Yemeni Embassy. He was not arrested. But Pakistan authorities told US Forces that he was Al-Qaeda. He was turned over to US Forces in Peshawar PK and US Forces took him to Kandahar AF.

The Detainee asks that the Tribunal make their decision with the Truth and that all the information in his unclassified summary are lies and fabricated to hold him. He went to Pakistan and Afghanistan to teach the Quran and he taught the Quran in Yemen before he left for Pakistan. The Detainee states that he is innocent and that the whole world is his witness.

Major, USAF
Personal Representative Review of the Record of Proceedings

I acknowledge that on 21 September 2004 I was provided the opportunity to review the record of proceedings for the Combatant Status Review Tribunal involving ISN #.

X I have no comments.

My comments are attached.

[Signature]

Date: 21 SEP 04

UNCLASSIFIED//FOUO